

Berachos 2

1) THE TIME FOR SAYING "KERI'AS SHEMA"

- (a) **(Mishnah) Question:** When do we say Keri'as Shema at night?
- (b) **Answer #1 (R. Eliezer):** The Mitzvah is from the time at which Kohanim may eat Terumah until the end of the first Mishmar (these will be explained).
- (c) **Answer #2 (Chachamim):** The time extends until midnight.
- (d) **Answer #3 (R. Gamliel):** The time extends until dawn.
- (e) **A case occurred:** R. Gamliel's sons came home from a wedding after midnight (they had not said Shema).
 - 1. **R. Gamliel:** You are **obligated to say it now**;
 - 2. In fact, wherever Chachamim said "until midnight," the Mitzvah (mid'Oraisa) is until dawn:
 - i. Chelev (of Korbanos) and limbs (of an Olah) may be burned on the Mizbe'ach until dawn;
 - ii. Any Korban that may be eaten for one day and a night is permitted until dawn.
 - 3. **Question:** If so, why did Chachamim say, "until midnight"?
 - 4. **Answer:** This is to distance people from transgression (lest dawn arrive before one performs the Mitzvah).
- (f) **(Gemara) Question #1:** It is unreasonable to ask about the time of Keri'as Shema before teaching that it is a Mitzvah! What is the Tana's source for the obligation to recite Shema?
- (g) **Question #2:** Why does the Tana first ask about the time for the nighttime Shema? He should first ask about the time for the morning Shema! (We find that the Torah / teaches about the morning Tamid before he afternoon Tamid.)
- (h) **Answer #1 (to both questions):** The Tana expounds the verse, "uv"Shochbecha uv"Kumecha." Therefore, he first asks about the time of Shechivah (going to sleep).
- (i) **Answer #2 (to Question #2):** He learns from creation of the world that night comes first, as it says, "va'Yehi Erev va'Yehi Voker Yom Echad."
- (j) **Question (Mishnah):** In the morning, there are two Berachos before Shema and one after; at night, there are two Berachos before and two after.
 - 1. According to both answers, the Tana should teach about the Berachos of the nighttime Shema first!
- (k) **Answer:** The Tana begins our Mishnah with the nighttime Shema and concludes with the morning Shema; once he discusses the morning Shema, he teaches all its laws, then returns to discuss the nighttime Shema.

2) WHEN "KOHANIM" MAY EAT "TERUMAH"

- (a) **(Mishnah - R. Eliezer):** The Mitzvah is from when Kohanim may eat Terumah...
- (b) (The time Kohanim may eat Terumah always refers to a Kohen who was Tamei and immersed; he is a Tevul Yom and may not even touch Terumah until night.)
- (c) **Question:** Kohanim may eat at Tzeis ha'Kochavim (when stars become visible at night) -- the Mishnah should say this explicitly!
- (d) **Answer:** The Tana taught the time of Shema indirectly, in order to teach as well that Kohanim may eat Terumah at Tzeis ha'Kochavim;
1. One might have thought that the Heter for a Mechusar Kipurim (one who must bring Korbanos to finish his Taharah, e.g. a Zav) to eat Terumah comes [during the day], when he brings the Korbanos. The Mishnah teaches that this is not so; the Heter is the night after he immerses, before bringing the Korbanos.
 2. **(Beraisa):** "u'Va ha'Shemesh v'Taher" -- the setting of the sun is required before he can eat Terumah; the Korban is not required.
 3. **Version #1 (Rashi) Question:** How does the Tana know that "u'Va ha'Shemesh" refers to the setting of the sun, and "v'Taher" refers to completion of the day?

2b-----2b

- i. Perhaps "u'Va ha'Shemesh" refers to the rising of the sun (the day after immersion), and "v'TaHer" refers to the person (who completes his Taharah by bringing Korbanos)!
- (e) **Version #2 (Tosfos) Question:** How do we know that "u'Va ha'Shemesh" refers to Tzeis ha'Kochavim, and "v'TaHer" refers to completion of the day?
1. Perhaps "u'Va ha'Shemesh" refers to sundown, and "v'TaHer" refers to the person (whose Taharah is complete, even though it is still day)! (End of Version #2)
 2. **Answer (Rabah bar Rav Shila):** If so, the Torah would have said "va'YetaHer" (to show clearly that it refers to the person);ⁱ Rather, it says "v'TaHer" to refer to the day; this is like people say, "The sun went down and the day is finished."
- (f) In Eretz Yisrael, they did not hear Rabah's teaching, and thus they had a question.
- (g) **Question:** Does "u'Va ha'Shemesh" refer to Tzeis ha'Kochavim, and "v'TaHer" to the completion of the day, or does "u'Va ha'Shemesh" refer to sunset (Tosfos; Rashi - sunrise), and "v'TaHer" to the person?
- (h) **Answer (Beraisa):** A sign [of when Kohanim may eat] is Tzeis ha'Kochavim.
1. This shows that the verse refers to Tzeis ha'Kochavim and the completion of the day.

3) THE EARLIEST TIME FOR THE NIGHTTIME "*SHEMA*"

- (a) **(Mishnah - R. Eliezer):** The Mitzvah [of Shema] is from the time at which Kohanim may eat Terumah.
- (b) **Contradiction (Beraisa #1):** Question: When do we say Keri'as Shema at night?
1. **Answer:** The Mitzvah is from when an Ani (a poor person, who eats without the light of a lamp) begins to eat bread with salt, until he finishes his meal.
 2. Surely, the Beraisa argues [with all opinions in our Mishnah] about the latest time for Shema (an Ani's meal does not last four hours);ⁱ Must we say that it also argues about the earliest time for Shema?
- (c) **Answer:** No, the times of an Ani (when he eats) and Kohen (when he may eat Terumah) are the same.
- (d) **Contradiction (Beraisa #2):** Question: From when may we say Shema at night?
1. **Answer #1 (R. Meir):** The Mitzvah begins when people begin to eat bread on Shabbos night (which is early, since everything is already prepared);

2. Answer #2 (Chachamim): It is from when Kohanim may eat Terumah; a sign for this time is Tzeis ha'Kochavim;

i. A support for this, but not a proof, is the verse, "va'Anachnu Osim ba'Melachah... me'Alos ha'Shachar Ad Tzeis ha'Kochavim" (people work from dawn until nightfall);

ii. It also says, "v'Hayu Lanu ha'Lailah Mishmar veba'Yom Melachah."

iii. **Question:** Why do we need the second verse?

iv. **Answer:** One might have thought that night begins before Tzeis ha'Kochavim (and day begins after dawn), and they were working more than usual (to build the Beis ha'Mikdash). The second verse shows that this is not so.

3. We are thinking that an Ani eats at the same time as regular people [eat on Shabbos].

4. **Summation of question:** If the times of Ani and Kohen are the same, then Chachamim agree with R. Meir!

i. Rather, we must say that they are different.

(e) **Answer:** Really, they are the same. The times of Ani and regular people are different.

(f) **Question:** The times of Ani and Kohen are not the same!

1. **(Beraisa #3) Question:** From when may we say Shema at night?

2. **Answer #1 (R. Eliezer):** The Mitzvah begins at Kidush ha'Yom (when the prohibitions of Shabbos take effect on Shabbos night, i.e. at Bein ha'Shemashos, which is Safek day, Safek night).

3. **Answer #2 (R. Yehoshua):** It begins when Kohanim may eat Terumah;

4. **Answer #3 (R. Meir):** It begins at the [latest] time [during the day] that Kohanim may immerse to eat Terumah [that night];

5. **Objection (R. Yehudah):** They must immerse during the day [while Shema must be said at night]!

6. **Answer #4 (R. Chanina):** It begins when an Ani comes in to eat bread with salt.

7. **Answer #5 (Rav Achai):** It begins when most people come in to eat.

8. **Summation of question:** If the times of Ani and Kohen are the same, then R. Yehoshua and R. Chanina say the same thing!

i. **Conclusion:** The times are different.

(g) **Question:** Which of them is the latest time?

(h) **Answer:** Presumably, Ani is latest, for if not, then R. Eliezer and R. Chanina say the same thing! (Surely an Ani does not stop working before Bein ha'Shemashos. Bein ha'Shemashos is shortly before Tzeis ha'Kochavim, so it is unreasonable that three Tana'im argue about times that are so close together!)

(i) **(Beraisa - R. Yehudah) Objection:** They must immerse during the day! (Bein ha'Shemashos extends for nine minutes; Kohanim must immerse before it starts,

Shema is said when people go to sleep when it is definitely night, at least nine minutes later!)

- (j) **Question:** This is a valid objection! (How can R. Meir answer it?)

27b-----27b

2. (Beraisa - R. Eliezer): The following cause the Shechinah to depart from Yisrael:

i. One who prays in back of his Rebbi, gives or returns a greeting of Shalom to his Rebbi (like he does to anyone else), argues with his Rebbi's teaching (i.e. sets up his own academy to expound, without his Rebbi's permission), or says (R. Yonah - in his Rebbi's name) something that he did not hear from his Rebbi.

(m) Answer: R. Yirmeyah bar Aba was a Talmid Chaver of Rav (a peer of Rav's who had learned from him).

(n) Support: He asked Rav, "Badalta?" ("Have you decided to refrain from Melachah (by accepting Kedushas Shabbos before praying Ma'ariv of Shabbos)?" Rav answered, "Yes";

1. A Talmid (who is not a Talmid Chaver) may not address his Rebbi this way (in the second person, rather, in the third person, with a title of respect).

(o) Question: Must one indeed accept Shabbos before praying Ma'ariv of Shabbos?!

1. (R. Avin): Rebbi once prayed Ma'ariv of Shabbos on Erev Shabbos, entered the bathhouse (which is forbidden on Shabbos) and taught to us!

(p) Answer (Rava): Rebbi entered the bathhouse to sweat, before Chachamim prohibited this on Shabbos.

(q) Question: But Abaye permitted Rav Dimi bar Livai to fumigate baskets (after praying Ma'ariv of Shabbos on Erev Shabbos)!

(r) Answer: The case was, Rav Dimi erred. (He had not intended to accept Kedushas Shabbos early. It was a cloudy day, he thought that night had come. When the sun reappeared, Abaye permitted him to do Melachah.)

(s) Question: We do not retract such a mistake!

1. (Avidan): Once, it was very cloudy, everyone thought that night had come, they prayed Ma'ariv of Motza'i Shabbos; when the sun reappeared, Rebbi said that they need not pray again.

(t) Answer: [An individual would pray again after such a mistake, but] we do not trouble a Tzibur [to return to synagogue to pray again].

3) PRAYING MA'ARIV BEFORE EVENING (cont.)

(a) (R. Chiya bar Avin): Rav used to pray Ma'ariv of Shabbos on Erev Shabbos; R. Yoshiyah used to pray Ma'ariv of Motza'i Shabbos on Shabbos.

(b) Question: Rav used to pray Ma'ariv of Shabbos on Erev Shabbos -- would he

[wait until evening to] say Kidush on a cup of wine, or not?

- (c) **Answer:** Rav Nachman taught that one may pray Ma'ariv of Shabbos on Erev Shabbos and say Kidush over wine (before evening).
- (d) The Halachah follows Rav Nachman.
- (e) **Question:** R. Yoshiyah used to pray Ma'ariv of Motza'i Shabbos on Shabbos -- would he say Havdalah over wine (right away, or would he wait until evening)?
- (f) **Answer:** Rav Yehudah taught that one may pray Ma'ariv of Motza'i Shabbos on Shabbos and say Havdalah over wine.
- (g) **(R. Zeira):** A case occurred, R. Yishmael b'Rebbi Yosi prayed Ma'ariv of Shabbos on Erev Shabbos next to this pillar.
- (h) **(Ula):** No -- the case was, R. Elazar b'Rebbi Yosi prayed Ma'ariv of Motza'i Shabbos on Shabbos next to a date tree.
- (i) **(Mishnah):** Ma'ariv is not Kavu'a (fixed).
- (j) **Question:** What does this mean?
1. **Suggestion:** One may pray at any time during the night.
 2. **Rejection:** If so, the Mishnah should say, "The time for Ma'ariv is the entire night"!
- (k) **Answer:** Our Mishnah follows the opinion that Ma'ariv is Reshus (optional); Tosfos - i.e. one may perform a different Mitzvah that cannot be done later instead of praying Ma'ariv).
1. **(Rav Yehudah):** R. Gamliel says that Ma'ariv is Chovah (mandatory), R. Yehoshua says that it is Reshus.
- (l) **(Abaye):** The Halachah follows the opinion that it is Chovah.
- (m) **(Rava):** The Halachah follows the opinion that it is Reshus.
- (n) **(Beraisa):** A case occurred, R. Yehoshua told a certain Talmid (who had asked) that Ma'ariv is Reshus; R. Gamliel answered him that it is Chovah.
1. **The Talmid:** But R. Yehoshua said that it is Reshus!
 2. **R. Gamliel:** Wait until Ba'alei Trisim (Rashi - great Chachamim that wage the "war" of Halachah; Aruch - guards) enter the Beis Medrash.
 3. The Ba'alei Trisim entered the Beis Medrash; the Talmid asked his question, and R. Gamliel answered, "Chovah."
 4. R. Gamliel asked if anyone disagrees; R. Yehoshua said, "No."
 5. **R. Gamliel:** I heard that you disagree -- stand up, they will testify about what you said!
 6. **R. Yehoshua:** I cannot contradict the Talmid, for he is alive.
- (o) R. Gamliel was sitting and expounding, R. Yehoshua was standing, everyone was murmuring; they told Chutzpis to stop (he was translating and broadcasting for R. Gamliel).
- (p) **Rabanan:** Also before, R. Gamliel pained R. Yehoshua, in a case of establishing which day will be Rosh Hashanah, and in the episode with R. Tzadok -- this cannot continue! We must choose a different Nasi.

1. We cannot appoint R. Yehoshua, for he was an involved party (this would pain R. Gamliel too)